A few limitations in the available fs-related system calls...

Nick Kossifidis <mick@ics.forth.gr>





Software for Cloud Services and Applications

Organization: FORTH (Greece) Email: maraz@ics.forth.gr

Copying a file...

- Preserve file data
 - Time efficiency
 - Space efficiency
- Preserve file metadata
 - Permission bits
 - Ownership (user/group)
 - Timestamps
 - Old school attributes
 - Extended attributes

System calls for copying data...

• The naive approach: open(), read(), write(), close()

- The most generic/portable way but very inefficient
- Datapath goes through userspace, kernel copies to user on read, from user on write

• Using sendfile()

- Linux, FreeBSD (thank you Netflix !)
- Copying is done in-kernel, without going through userspace
- Uses a temporary buffer: source -> buffer (pipe) -> dest
- Probably the most common technique used today

Using copy_file_range()

- Linux-only
- Takes advantage of fs features (e.g. COW, REFLINK, NFS server-side copy etc), and in the future will also take advantage of hw features (e.g. NVme simple copy)
- This is meant to be the new/default API for this
- Preserve holes on sparse files: Iseek(SEEK_DATA/SEEK_END), ftruncate()

System calls for preserving metadata...

- Permission bits using {f}chmod{at}()
- Ownership using {f,l}chown{at}()
- atime/mtime using utimens{at}()
- Preserve old-style 32bit attributes mask using ioctl(FS_IOC_{G,S}ETFLAGS)

```
* We have recently hoisted FS IOC FSGETXATTR / FS IOC FSSETXATTR from
 * XFS to the generic FS level interface. This uses a structure that
 * has padding and hence has more room to grow, so it may be more
 * appropriate for many new use cases.
 * Please do not change these flags or interfaces before checking with
 * linux-fsdevel@vger.kernel.org and linux-api@vger.kernel.org.
#define FS SECRM FL
                                        0x00000001 /* Secure deletion */
#define FS UNRM FL
                                       0x00000002 /* Undelete */
#define FS_COMPR_FL
                                        0x00000004 /* Compress file */
#define FS_SYNC FL
                                       0x00000008 /* Synchronous updates */
#define FS_IMMUTABLE_FL
                                       0x00000010 /* Immutable file */
#define FS APPEND FL
                                        0x00000020 /* writes to file may only append */
#define FS_NODUMP_FL
                                       0x00000040 /* do not dump file */
#define FS NOATIME FL
                                       0x00000080 /* do not update atime */
/* Reserved for compression usage... */
#define FS DIRTY FL
                                        0200000100
#define FS COMPRBLK FL
                                       0x00000200 /* One or more compressed clusters */
#define FS_NOCOMP_FL
                                       0x00000400 /* Don't compress */
/* End compression flags ---- maybe not all used */
#define FS_ENCRYPT_FL
                                       0x00000800 /* Encrypted file */
#define FS BTREE FL
                                        0x00001000 /* btree format dir */
#define FS INDEX FL
                                       0x00001000 /* hash-indexed directorv */
#define FS_IMAGIC_FL
                                       0x00002000 /* AFS directory */
#define FS JOURNAL DATA FL
                                        0x00004000 /* Reserved for ext3 */
#define FS_NOTAIL_FL
                                       0x00008000 /* file tail should not be merged */
#define FS_DIRSYNC_FL
                                        0x00010000 /* dirsync behaviour (directories only) */
#define FS_TOPDIR_FL
                                       0x00020000 /* Top of directory hierarchies*/
#define FS HUGE FILE FL
                                       0x00040000 /* Reserved for ext4 */
#define FS EXTENT FL
                                        0x00080000 /* Extents */
#define FS_VERITY FL
                                       0x00100000 /* Verity protected inode */
#define FS_EA_INODE_FL
                                        0x00200000 /* Inode used for large EA */
#define FS_EOFBLOCKS_FL
                                       0x00400000 /* Reserved for ext4 */
#define FS_NOCOW_FL
                                        0x00800000 /* Do not cow file */
#define FS_DAX_FL
                                        0x02000000 /* Inode is DAX */
#define FS INLINE DATA FL
                                       0x10000000 /* Reserved for ext4 */
#define FS PROJINHERIT FL
                                        0x20000000 /* Create with parents projid */
#define FS_CASEFOLD FL
                                        0x40000000 /* Folder is case insensitive */
#define FS_RESERVED_FL
                                       0x80000000 /* reserved for ext2 lib */
#define FS_FL_USER_VISIBLE
                                        0x0003DFFF /* User visible flags */
```

#define FS FL USER MODIFIABLE

0x000380FF /* User modifiable flags */

System calls for preserving metadata...

- Extended attributes (key:value pairs), using {list,set,get}xattr()
 - "POSIX" ACLs (acl(7)): system.posix_acl_access/default
 - NFSv4 ACLs (honored by the nfs client): system.nfs4acl/nfs4_acl
 - Inline-data (ext4(5)): system.data
 - Per-file capabilities (capabilities(7)): security.capability
 - SELinux file contexts: security.selinux/security.sehash
 - AppArmor labels (apparmor_xattrs(7)): e.g. security.apparmor
 - SMACK attributes: security.SMACK64*
 - Integrity measurement: security.evm/security.ima
 - Privileged userspace stuff: trusted.*
 - Unprivileged userspace stuff: user.*
 - \circ and more...
 - \circ $\,$ $\,$ Honor /etc/xattrs.conf, that includes xattr patterns to skip $\,$

Issues so far...

- **copy_file_range()** may expand holes on sparse files
- No io_uring op for **sendfile()** / **copy_file_range()**
- The {at} system call variants (using O_PATH descriptors) are very useful !
 - But there are no {list,set,get}xattrat() syscalls !
 - fchmodat() doesn't support the AT_EMPTY_PATH flag -> Fixed on 6.6 with fchmodat2()
 - **utimensat()** does support AT_EMPTY_PATH but the man page doesn't mention it
- IMHO There should be a single API for file attributes, having to use ioctl() doesn't look nice.
- No registry of xattrs used by the kernel, more documentation is needed ! Multiple xattrs cannot be set through xattr API.

Capabilities required for backup...

- For read access to files we don't own: CAP_DAC_READ_SEARCH
- For preserving special files (devices/sockets etc): CAP_MKNOD
- For preserving ownership: CAP_CHOWN
- For chmod/utimens, attrs, most xattrs, using O_NOATIME etc: CAP_FOWNER
 - If we have CAP_CHOWN we can skip this, we can preserve all we can and then change owner
- For the APPEND/IMMUTABLE attr: CAP_LINUX_IMMUTABLE
- For security.capabilities: CAP_SETFCAP
- For security/trusted xattrs: CAP_SYS_ADMIN -> That's overkill !
- This is confusing and inconsistent !

When to backup a file...

- We can track data changes through mtime/size and compare between src/dst
 - But this is insecure/unreliable.
 - Rsync does crc32 which is still insecure, we could do e.g. SHA on both src/dst but that also has a serious overhead.
 - We could use IMA (security.ima) but that's not available over NFS.
 - We could compare ctime to make sure that mtime wasn't modified since our last backup but we can't preserve ctime on dst to do the comparison !
- We can't track metadata changes without reading them all (including all xattrs) !
 - Also because ctime cannot be preserved on dst, so we can't compare it with src.

On preserving ctime for comparison...

- Why are we able to preserve atime/mtime and not ctime?
 - There is a chicken-and-egg issue, since changing ctime should also update ctime
 - It's the most reliable way to determine if a file's data/metadata changed, better let the kernel handle it
- But there are ways around this for privileged users
 - One can set the system time and force a ctime update by performing a modification on data/metadata
 - It's possible to modify the data on-disk, like I did for example with ext4backup (<u>https://github.com/mickflemm/ext4backup</u>)
 - It could even be done without unmounting the partition, using fsfreeze.
- And in some cases it's not maintained in a consistent way e.g. for networked file systems (look for S_NOCTIME).
- So why not have a privileged API (e.g. a flag on utimens{at} or something new, with a proper capability e.g. CAP_CTIME) ?

What about btime/crtime ?

- It's probably more useful as it is, no need to preserve it.
 - There are cases where a file will be re-created on edit (e.g. vi does that) so btime/crtime says nothing about when the file's contents were created.
 - We could however have a standard xattr for file content creation (in case it's not supported by the file format).
- BTW NFS server exports btime/crtime but NFS client doesn't use it.

Backing up encrypted files...

- With eCryptfs -> just copy the encrypted files (and ~/.ecryptfs etc)
- With fscrypt -> Not possible !
 - We can use statx to see if a file/dir/symlink is encrypted (STATX_ATTR_ENCRYPTED)
 - We can determine if the required key is present (so that we can copy them unencrypted)
 - For regular files we can try to open() them and fail with ENOKEY
 - For dirs we can do an ioctl()
 - For symlinks -> Not possible !
 - No way to copy data in encrypted form !

Summary...

- Add {list,set,get}xattrat() syscalls.
- Wrap old attrs as xattrs so that we don't use ioctl(FS_IOC_{G,S}ETFLAGS) and have a common API for all attributes.
- Add a flag to copy_file_range() to preserve holes on sparse files, and also make it a io_uring op.
- Document all special xattrs / those used/set by the kernel, and the required capabilities to get/set them. Maybe also a new capability to set security/trusted xattrs without requiring CAP_SYS_ADMIN.
- Come up with a way to get a file's measurement (or even just a hash of its data/metadata, as long as it's only the kernel that can set it) without having to read the whole thing in userspace, that works over NFS.
- Come up with a privileged API to preserve ctime.
- Come up with an API for backing up fscrypt files in encrypted form.

Questions?

Thank you !